



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 06102130 9

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW
2006

CASES AND MATERIALS

Professor Janet Walker

ALMA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 30 2006
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW 2006

CASES AND MATERIALS

Professor Janet Walker^{*}

Introduction

| | |
|--|---|
| Beals v Saldanha | 1 |
| Constitution Act/Courts of Justice Act | 3 |

PART I - JUDGMENTS

1. The Conclusiveness of Foreign Judgments

| | |
|---------------------|---|
| Godard v Gray | 6 |
| Lax v Lax | 9 |

2. The Requirements for Recognition and Enforcement

(a) Prima Facie Enforceability

(i) Jurisdiction in the International Sense

| | |
|---|----|
| Schibsby v Westenholz | 14 |
| Constitution of the United States of America, Article IV, Amendments V, XIV | 18 |
| International Shoe Co v State of Washington | 18 |
| Morguard Investments Ltd. v De Savoye | 22 |
| Braintech, Inc v Kostiuk | 36 |

(ii) Finality

| | |
|--|----|
| Four Embarcadero Center Venture v Mr. Greenjeans Corp. | 41 |
| Uniforêt Pate Port-Cartier v Zerotech Technologies Inc. | 44 |
| Pro Swing Inc v ELTA Golf Inc..... | 49 |
| Beatty v Beatty | 51 |
| Interjurisdictional Support Orders Act..... | 52 |

(b) Foreign public law exception

| | |
|--|----|
| United States of America v Ivey | 57 |
| Cuban Liberty and Democratic Solidarity (Libertad) Act of 1996 | 68 |
| Foreign Extraterritorial Measures Act | 69 |

(c) Impeachment

(i) Fraud

| | |
|-----------------------------------|----|
| Beals v Saldanha (majority) | 74 |
|-----------------------------------|----|

(ii) Natural Justice

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----|
| Beals v Saldanha (dissent) | 86 |
| Orabi v Qaoud | 93 |
| State Bank of India v Navaratna..... | 97 |

(iii) Public Policy

| | |
|--|-----|
| Boardwalk Regency Corp. v Maalouf..... | 106 |
| Kidron v Grean..... | 112 |

^{*} These materials are provided solely for the use of the students in LAW228H1S in the First Term of 2006.

| | |
|---|-----|
| (iv) Prior Inconsistent Local Judgment | |
| Vervaeke (Formerly Messina) v Smith | 116 |

3. Codifications in Federal and Regional Systems

| | |
|---|-----|
| Québec Civil Code: Book Ten - Title Four | 121 |
| Brussels Regulation - Preamble, Articles 1, 32-56 | 123 |
| Uniform Enforcement of Canadian Judgments Act | 129 |
| ALI- Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Judgments Act | 131 |
| Hague Choice of Court Convention | 136 |

PART II – JURISDICTION

1. The Bases of Jurisdiction

a) Consent

(i) Attornment

| | |
|---|-----|
| Roglass Consultants v Kennedy | 139 |
| Dovenmuehle v Rocca Group | 139 |
| Currie v McDonald’s Restaurants of Canada Ltd | 142 |
| Brussels Regulation - Articles 24-26 | 152 |

(ii) Agreement

| | |
|--|-----|
| McKender v Feldia | 153 |
| “The Canmar Fortune” | 158 |
| Rudder v Microsoft Corp | 165 |
| Underwriters at Lloyds’ v Mauraan | 169 |
| Brussels Regulation - Article 23 | 170 |
| GreCon Dimter Inc v JR Normand Inc | 171 |

(b) Defendant’s Home Court

(i) Individuals

| | |
|--|-----|
| Maharanees of Baroda v Wildenstein | 178 |
| Burham v Superior Court | 181 |

(ii) Corporations

| | |
|---|-----|
| Extra-provincial Corporations Act | 187 |
| Adams v Cape Industries plc | 187 |
| ILA Committee on International Civil and Commercial Litigation Resolution | 189 |

(iii) Assets

| | |
|--|-----|
| SDI Simulation Group Inc. v Chameleon Technologies Inc. | 189 |
| Tortel Communication Inc. v Suntel, Inc. | 192 |

(iii) Domicile/Residence

| | |
|--|-----|
| Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 16.03 | 194 |
|--|-----|

(c) Real and Substantial Connection

| | |
|---|-----|
| Rule 17 — Service Outside Ontario | 195 |
| Moran v Pyle National (Canada) Ltd. | 197 |
| Uniform Court Jurisdiction and Proceedings Transfer Act: Part 2 | 200 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Brussels Regulation - Articles 5-21 | 203 |
| Québec Civil Code: Book Ten – Title Three | 207 |
| Spar Aerospace..... | 209 |

(d) Order and Fairness

| | |
|---------------------------|-----|
| Muscutt v Courcelles..... | 223 |
|---------------------------|-----|

2. Determining Appropriate Forum

(a) The Doctrine of Forum Non Conveniens

| | |
|--|-----|
| Airbus Industrie GIE v Patel | 241 |
| Amchem Products Inc. v British Columbia (Workers' Compensation Board)..... | 242 |
| Spiliada Maritime Corp. v Cansulex Ltd. | 259 |
| Societe Nationale Industrielle Aerospatiale v Lee Kui Juk | 266 |
| Owusu v Jackson..... | 272 |

(b) The Burden of Proof

| | |
|------------------------------|-----|
| Frymer v Brettschneider..... | 278 |
|------------------------------|-----|

(c) Personal/Juridical Advantage

| | |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| Jaffe v Dearing | 282 |
| Connelley v RTZ Corporation plc..... | 285 |
| Lubbe v Cape plc..... | 290 |
| Oakley v Barry | 295 |

(d) Jurisdiction Agreements

| | |
|------------------------------------|-----|
| The “Angelic Grace” | 300 |
| Erich Gasser GmbH v Misat Srl..... | 307 |

(e) The Injunction Test Revisited

| | |
|--|-----|
| Airbus Industrie GIE v Patel | 315 |
| Hudon v Geos Language Corporation..... | 325 |
| Turner v Grovit..... | 328 |

(f) Single Forum Cases/Negative Declarations

| | |
|---|-----|
| Midland Bank plc v Laker Airways Ltd..... | 331 |
|---|-----|

(g) Multiplicity

| | |
|---|-----|
| Brussels Convention - Articles 21-23 | 335 |
| 472900 BC Ltd v Thrifty Canada. | 335 |
| Westec Aerospace Inc v Raytheon Aircraft Co. | 342 |
| Leuven/London Principles | 349 |

(h) Transfers of Proceedings

| | |
|--|-----|
| 28 United States Code Service §§1404, 1406 | 352 |
|--|-----|

| | |
|---|-----|
| Jurisdiction of Courts (Cross-vesting) Act, 1987 (Australia) | 353 |
| Bankinvest AG v Seabrook | 354 |
| Uniform Court Jurisdiction and Proceedings Transfer Act: Part 3 | 356 |

(i) Interim Relief

| | |
|--|-----|
| Brussels Convention - Article 24 | 358 |
| Aetna Financial Services Limited v Feigelman | 358 |
| Republic of Haiti v Duvalier | 361 |
| United States of America v Friedland | 367 |
| United States of America v Yemec | 368 |

3. Limitations on Jurisdiction

(a) State Immunity

| | |
|---|-----|
| The State Immunity Act | 374 |
| Schreiber v Federal Republic of Germany | 377 |
| Bouzari v Iran | 384 |

(b) Matters Subject to Treaty

| | |
|---|-----|
| Carriage by Air Act | 393 |
| Gal v Northern Mountain Helicopters Inc | 393 |
| Marine Liability Act, s 46 | 397 |
| Magic Sportswear Corp v The Mathilde Maersk | 398 |
| International Commercial Arbitration Act | 402 |
| Kaverit Steel and Crane v Kone Corp | 409 |
| Masterfile Corp v Graphic Images Ltd | 415 |

(c) Exclusive Jurisdiction

| | |
|---|-----|
| Duke v Andler | 417 |
| Brussels Regulation - Articles 22, 25 | 421 |
| Voyage Co Industries v Craster | 422 |
| West v Wilbur | 424 |
| Nord Resources Corp v Nord Pacific Ltd | 426 |
| Compensation (Prohibition of Foreign Legal Proceedings) Act 1995 (PPNG) | 428 |
| Quebec Civil Code, Arts 3129, 3151 | 429 |

PART III – CHOICE OF LAW-GENERAL PRINCIPLES

1. Choice of Law Methodology

| | |
|---|-----|
| Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust plc (No 3) | 431 |
| Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One | 432 |
| Babcock v Jackson | 433 |
| Bernhard v Harrah's Club | 436 |
| Breavington v Godleman | 442 |
| Stevens v Head | 445 |
| Hunt v T&N plc | 446 |

2. Proof of Foreign Law

| | |
|--|-----|
| Old North State Brewing Co v Newlands Services Inc | 453 |
|--|-----|

| | |
|---|-----|
| Royal Trust Corp of Canada v AS(W)S | 460 |
| Petkus v Becker | 464 |
| Etler v Kertesz | 465 |
| Mercantile Mutual Insurance (Australia) Ltd v Neilson | 466 |

3. Characterization and the Incidental Question

| | |
|--|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One, Article 3078 | 469 |
| Kingsway General Insurance Co v Canada Life Assurance Co | 470 |
| Agnew v Gober | 472 |
| Schwebel v Ungar | 474 |

4. Domicile

| | |
|---|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title Two, Chapter I – Personal Status | 475 |
| Winans v Attorney General | 477 |
| Re Annesley | 480 |
| Osthvath-Latcoczy v Osthvath-Latcoczy | 483 |
| Patterson v Patterson | 484 |
| White v Tennant | 486 |

5. Renvoi and the Time Element

| | |
|---|-----|
| Re Annesley | 491 |
| Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One, Article 3080 | 493 |
| Ross v Ross | 493 |
| Neilson v Overseas Projects Corporation of Victoria Ltd | 495 |
| Starkowski v AG | 503 |
| Roy v North American Leisure Group Inc | 505 |

6. Substance and Procedure

(a) The Basic Rule

| | |
|---|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One, Articles 3132, 3133 | 508 |
| Tolofson v Jensen | 509 |
| Castillo v Castillo | 512 |

(b) Examples

(i) Evidence

| | |
|------------------|-----|
| In re Cohn | 514 |
|------------------|-----|

(ii) Remedies

| | |
|-------------------------|-----|
| Somers v Fournier | 515 |
|-------------------------|-----|

7. Foreign Public Law

| | |
|--|-----|
| Laane v Estonian Cargo and Passenger Steamship Line..... | 526 |
| AG (UK) v Heinemann Publishers Australia Pty Ltd..... | 529 |
| Kuwait Airways Corporation v Iraqi Airways | 535 |

8. Public Policy

| | |
|---------------------|-----|
| Vladi v Vladi | 548 |
|---------------------|-----|

PART IV – CHOICE OF LAW: AREAS OF LAW

1. Tort

| | |
|--|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title Two, Articles 3126-3128 | 553 |
| Tolofson v Jensen; Lucas v Gagnon | 554 |
| Johnson v Coventry Churchill International Ltd..... | 570 |
| Hanlan v Sernesky..... | 575 |
| Wong v Wei | 576 |
| Wong v Lee | 582 |
| PIL (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1995 Part III - Choice of Law in Tort and Delict .. | 592 |
| Shevill v Presse Alliance SA..... | 594 |

2. Contract

(a) Determining the Proper Law

| | |
|---|-----|
| Star Texas | 598 |
| Imperial Life Assurance Co. of Canada v Colmenares | 602 |
| Amin Rasheed Shipping Corporation v Kuwait Insurance Co | 604 |
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3111-3113 | 607 |
| The Rome Convention- Articles 1-4, 10, 12-15, 17-19 | 608 |

(b) Applying the Proper Law

(i) Capacity

| | |
|--|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3083-3087 | 611 |
| The Rome Convention- Article 11 | 611 |
| Bondholders Securities Corp v Manville | 612 |

(ii) Validity

| | |
|---|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3109-3110 | 614 |
| The Rome Convention- Article 8 | 614 |
| Etler v Kertesz | 615 |

(iii) Special Kinds of Contracts

| | |
|---|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3114-3120 | 621 |
| The Rome Convention- Articles 5-7, 16 | 622 |

(iii) Harmonization of the Law of International Sales Contracts

| | |
|---------------------------------------|-----|
| International Sale of Goods Act | 624 |
|---------------------------------------|-----|

3. Property

| | |
|---------------------------------------|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Article 3097 | 625 |
|---------------------------------------|-----|

(a) Immovables

| | |
|--------------------------|-----|
| Godley v Coles | 626 |
| Landry v Lachapelle..... | 628 |

(b) Movable

| | |
|---|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3102-3106 | 630 |
| Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust plc (No 3) | 631 |
| Personal Property Security Act (ss. 5-8) | 640 |
| Re TCT Logistics Inc | 641 |

4. Succession

| | |
|--|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3098-3101, 3107-3108 | 646 |
|--|-----|

(a) Administration

| | |
|--|-----|
| Estates Administration Act | 647 |
| Estates Act | 647 |
| Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure | 649 |

(b) Succession

| | |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| Succession Law Reform Act | 649 |
| Re Vak Estate | 650 |
| Allison v Allison | 653 |

5. Family Law

(a) Formal Validity of Marriages

| | |
|---|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3088-3089 | 655 |
| Berthiaume v Dastous | 655 |
| McCabe v McCabe | 658 |

(b) Essential Validity of Marriages

| | |
|--|-----|
| Frew (otherwise Reed) v Reed | 660 |
| Marriage Act | 662 |
| Marriage (Prohibited Degrees) Act | 664 |
| Feiner v Demkowicz (falsely called Feiner) | 664 |
| Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) v Narwal | 667 |

(c) Divorce and Ancillary Relief

| | |
|--|-----|
| Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3090-3096, 3122-3124 | 670 |
| Divorce Act, ss 3-6, 22-23 | 671 |
| Family Law Act, ss 1, 15, 58 | 672 |

PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW – FIRST TERM 2006

Professor Janet Walker (416) 736-5580 jwalker@yorku.ca

<http://research.osgoode.yorku.ca/walker>

September

Thursdays 10:10-12:00

2:10-4:00

| | | |
|----|---|---|
| 7 | Introduction | I – JUDGMENTS - 1. Conclusiveness 2. Requirements (a) Enforceability (i) Jurisdiction |
| 14 | (ii) Finality (b) Foreign Public Law Exception | (c) Impeachment 3. Codifications |
| 21 | II – JURISDICTION 1. Bases of Jurisdiction (a) Consent | (b) Defendant's Home Court |
| 28 | (c) Real & Substantial Connection | (d) Order and Fairness |

October

| | | |
|----|---|--|
| 12 | 2. Determining Appropriate Forum (a) Forum Non Conveniens (b) Burden of Proof | (c) Personal/Juridical Advantage (d) Jurisdiction Agreements (e) Injunction Test Revisited |
| 19 | (f) Single Forum Cases/Negative Declarations (g) Multiplicity (h) Transfers of Proceedings (i) Interim Relief | 3. Limitations on Jurisdiction (a) State Immunity (b) Treaties |
| 20 | (Make-up Class from OCIs) (c) Exclusive Jurisdiction III-CHOICE OF LAW: GENERAL PRINCIPLES 1. Choice of Law Methodology 2. Proof of Foreign Law | |
| 26 | 3. Characterization/Incidental Question | 4. Domicile |

November

| | | |
|----|---|--|
| 2 | 5. Renvoi and the Time Element | 6. Substance and Procedure (a) General Principles |
| 16 | 6. (b) Examples: Evidence, Remedies | 7. Foreign Public Law 8. Public Policy |
| 23 | IV-CHOICE OF LAW: AREAS OF LAW 1. Tort | 2. Contract |
| 30 | 3. Property 4. Succession | 5. Family Law |

Examination: December 12 (Advance Essay Questions Available December 5)